What is the History of History?
History 97c • Spring 2016
Wednesdays 1-4pm



Prof. Ann Blair, amblair@fas
CGIS S437, 1730 Cambridge St
Office hours: M 2-4

and tutors Jamie McSpadden and Michael Thornton

Everything has a history, and the discipline of history has a particularly long and broad one. In this section we'll focus on ideas about how and why to study history and on the practices of historical research and writing as they have varied across different cultural contexts. In selected case studies we will consider who wrote and who read history, and how historians answered questions that we also ask ourselves today. E.g. What features are essential to a good historical account? Does the study of history teach moral lessons? How does history interact with memory?

The seminar will meet on Wednesdays, 1-4 pm. In weeks with tutorial meetings seminar participants are divided into tutorials of up to four students meeting either 1-2:30pm or 2:30-4pm (a second classroom will be booked for tutorial meetings held in parallel if necessary).

Course requirements

- Paper #1 due Monday Feb 8, 5pm: on Farge (1500 words) 10%;
  revised paper #1 due Monday Feb 15, 5pm.
- Paper #2 due Monday Feb 29, 5pm: Historiographic essay (1500 words) 10%;
  revised paper #2 due Monday March 7, 5pm
- Statement of topic and annotated bibliography due Monday March 28, 5pm**;**
  Note: this exercise, and the thesis statement and outline (due Monday April 11, 5pm) and the rough draft for the final paper (due Monday April 18, 5pm), will be assigned advisory grades that indicate what a grade for the final paper might be, based on the quality of these exercises. These grades are intended as advice--please take them seriously.
- Paper #3 due Monday April 4: Primary source analysis (1500 words) 10%; no revision, builds toward final paper
- Paper #4: Final paper (3500 words) 30%. Due in draft on Monday April 18, 5pm; final revised paper due Wednesday May 4, 5pm (last day of reading period) [or TBD]
- Participation in seminar (20%) and in tutorial (20%) 40%

All papers (except the final submission of the final paper) are due at 5pm two days before the day of the seminar, i.e. Mondays at 5pm. Papers must be submitted using the course website dropbox.

Hist 97c follows the course policies for Hist 97 as distributed separately and posted on the course website.

For purchase, ordered at the COOP (prices listed below are from amazon)--also on reserve in Lamont.
Arlette Farge, *The Allure of the Archives* (Yale UP); $14.67; 978-0300198935
Herbert Butterfield, *The Whig Interpretation of History* (NY: Norton, 1965) 978-0393003185; $12.75
Edward Gibbon, *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, abridged by David Womersley (Penguin Classics, 2001) 978-0140437645; $11.15
Readings not for sale will be provided via the course website.

Unit 1: historical narrative

The changing conceptions of history across time and space

Week 1 (Wed Jan. 27)--seminar: introduction to the theme. History among the disciplines

- Reading: something short TBA [possibly Peter Burke, "Images as Evidence in 17th-Century Europe," Journal of the History of Ideas 64 no. 2 (2003)]
- in-class exercises on what is history (also vs neighboring disciplines)
- Jamie and Michael to present sources from their work

Monday February 1: plenary meeting (CGIS Tsai Auditorium/South Concourse, 6-8pm). Faculty to discuss the theme of their seminar and how they feel Farge's *Allure of the Archives* relates to it.

Week II (Wed 3 Feb): seminar-- Arlette Farge

- Reading: Arlette Farge, *The Allure of the Archives* (2013)
- field trip to the Harvard University Archives

Monday 8 Feb, 5pm: Paper #1 due (1500 words; ca. 5pp)
Interpretive essay centered on Farge. Prompts TBA.

Week III (Wed 10 Feb): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.

Monday 15 Feb, 5pm: revised paper #1 due

Unit 2: historiography

Understanding successive layers of historical interpretation

Week IV (Wed 17 Feb): seminar: Herbert Butterfield

- Reading:
  - Herbert Butterfield, *The Whig Interpretation of History* (1931)
  - William Cronon, "Two Cheers for the Whig Interpretation of History," in *AHA Perspectives* Sept 2012
- Assignment: use E-resources to find 2 book reviews/responses to assigned reading. Bring a print-out of each and be prepared to present each of these briefly (2 minutes max) to the class. In addition, be prepared to explain the way in which you searched for and selected the book reviews.
- field trip: hands-on practice with Hollis and electronic resources.

Thursday Feb 18 (or thereabouts) 1-5pm: please come to office hours (as per sign-up distributed in seminar) to decide on a historical theme/area of interest to you, which will be the focus of paper #2 and ideally build toward your final paper. This is an appointment held jointly with Ann Blair and your TF.

Week V (Wed Feb 24)--seminar: tropes in writing history

- Reading:
  - Siep Stuurman, "Common Humanity and Cultural Difference on the Sedentary-Nomadic Frontier: Herodotus, Sima Qian, and Ibn Khaldun" in *Global Intellectual History*, eds. Moyn and Sartori (New York, 2013)
  - excerpts from Herodotus (from Donald Kelley, *Versions of History*); Sima Qian, *Records of the Grand Historian, Han dynasty*, vol. 2, pp. 129-45; and Ibn Khaldun?? (pdf)
- Assignment: identify and read two secondary sources of your choice (ideally one book [OK to read in parts] and one article) on the theme you choose for paper #2. In-class exercise: each student to share the historiographic theme(s) of his or her topic.

Monday Feb 29, 5pm: Paper #2 due (1500 words, ca. 5 pp)
Prompt (seminar specific on historiography): write a historiographic essay comparing and contrasting at least two works of history on a topic of your choice. Skills to practice: constructing a historical argument in interaction with historiography

Week VI (Wed 2 March): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.
- Assignment to prepare for next seminar: choose a source to show at the next seminar (upload to dropbox the call # and cut and paste from full Hollis record)

Monday Mar 7, 5pm: revised paper #2 due

Unit 3: primary source analysis (coursewide)

Highlighting the range of historians' primary sources and of ways of analyzing them.

Week VII (March 9)—seminar held at Houghton Library
Meet in the lobby of Houghton Library. Please travel as light as possible—you will be asked to put all your belongings in a locker. Pencil and notepaper are provided in the classroom.

- viewing the primary sources selected by students from various collections
- sharing time with intellectual history seminar: discussing a common text?

Spring break (March 17)

Week VIII (Wed 23 March): seminar: reading a primary source

- Skill: close reading of a primary source
- Reading:
  - Edward Gibbon, *Rise and Fall of the Roman Empire* (1776) (available in Womersley abridged ed): selections totaling 100pp TBA.
  - Peter Gay, *Style in History*, ch. on Gibbon (pp. 21-56)
  - John Clive, *Not by Fact Alone*, on Gibbon's humor, pp. 55-65
- final hour: students begin in-class preparation for capstone meeting presentation

Monday March 28, 5pm: statement of topic and annotated bibliography due

Week IX (Wed 30 March): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.

Monday April 4, 5pm: Paper #3 due (1500 words, ca. 5pp): Analysis of a passage from a primary source important to your final paper. No peer review for this paper which is designed to build toward the final paper.

Unit 4: synthesis

Merging historiographic and primary source analyses into a historical argument

Week X (April 6)--seminar: contextualizing a primary source, e.g. Gibbon

- Reading:
  - Biographical context: J.G.A. Pocock, *Barbarism and Religion* (1999), vol. 1, ch 2 (on Lausanne context).
  - Context of the history of history: Arnaldo Momigliano, "Gibbon's contribution to historical method" in *Studies in Historiography* (1966)
  - Printing history: http://www.edwardgibbonstudies.com/Decline-Fall5.htm
  - And skim Barker, Nicolas. "A Note on the Bibliography of Gibbon, 1776–1802," *The Library*, 5th ser., 18,1 (March 1963), 40-50.
  - Context of reception: Pocock, *Barbarism and Religion*, vol. 5, one chapter TBD on reception
- students continue in-class preparation for capstone meeting presentation

Monday April 11, 5pm: outline of final paper due

Week XI (Wed April 13): seminar: in class presentations on final paper

- Skill: oral presentation with visuals
- Assignment: prepare a 5-minute oral with handouts, powerpoint, or prezi.
- Class devoted to 5-minute presentations followed by 5 minutes of discussion

Monday April 18, 5pm: Draft final papers due (ca. 3500 words); these should integrate historiographical analysis, primary source analysis, and contextualization

Week XII (Wed 20 April) : tutorials

- Reading: read the drafts of your peers as assigned

Week XIII (Wed 27 April) : last seminar --wrap-up

- no reading
- concluding discussion
- Students to finalize capstone meeting presentations

Monday May 2, 6-8pm: capstone event/shared reflections of whole course, CGIS Tsai Auditorium/South Concourse, 6-8pm. Students to present their skits/visual displays/etc to the entire course: 10 minutes per seminar, followed by social time.

Revised final papers due Wednesday, May 4, 5pm (last day of reading period) **OR** on the earliest of the "final deadline" dates for the Hist 97 seminars, which should be determined by the Registrar at the beginning of spring semester.