What is the History of History?
History 97c • Spring 2017
Wednesdays 1-4pm



Prof. Ann Blair, amblair@fas
CGIS S437, 1730 Cambridge St
Office hours: M 2-4

and tutors Ian Kumekawa Salmaan Mirza

Everything has a history, and the discipline of history has a particularly long and broad one. In this section we'll focus on ideas about how and why to study history and on the practices of historical research and writing as they have varied across different cultural contexts. In selected case studies we will consider who wrote and who read history, and how historians answered questions that we also ask ourselves today. E.g. What features are essential to a good historical account? Does the study of history teach moral lessons? How does history interact with memory?

The seminar will meet on Wednesdays, 1-4 pm. In weeks with tutorial meetings seminar participants are divided into tutorials of up to four students meeting either 1-2:30pm or 2:30-4pm (a second classroom will be booked for tutorial meetings held in parallel if necessary).

Course requirements

- Paper #1 due Monday Feb 6, 5pm: on common reading (2 precis +1000 words) 10%;
  revised paper #1 due Monday Feb 13, 5pm.
- Paper #2 due Monday Feb 27, 5pm: Historiographic essay (1500 words) 10%; revised paper #2 due Monday March 6, 5pm
- Statement of topic and annotated bibliography due Monday March 27, 5pm**;** Note: this exercise, and the thesis statement and outline (due Monday April 10, 5pm) and the rough draft for the final paper (due Monday April 17, 5pm), will be assigned advisory grades that indicate what a grade for the final paper might be, based on the quality of these exercises. These grades are intended as advice--please take them seriously.
- Paper #3 due Monday April 3: Primary source analysis (1500 words) 10%; no revision, builds toward final paper
- Paper #4: Final paper (3500 words) 30%. Due in draft on Monday April 17, 5pm; final revised paper due TBD
- Participation in seminar (20%) and in tutorial (20%) 40%

All papers (except the final submission of the final paper) are due at 5pm two days before the day of the seminar, i.e. Mondays at 5pm. Papers must be submitted using the course website dropbox.

Hist 97c follows the course policies for Hist 97 as distributed separately and posted on the course website.

For purchase, ordered at the COOP (prices listed below are from amazon)--also on reserve in Lamont.
Herbert Butterfield, *The Whig Interpretation of History* (NY: Norton, 1965) 978-0393003185; $12.75
Edward Gibbon, *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*, abridged by David Womersley (Penguin Classics, 2001) 978-0140437645; $11.15
Readings not for sale will be provided via the course website.

Unit 1: historical narrative

The changing conceptions of history across time and space

Week 1 (Wed Jan. 27)--seminar: introduction to the theme. History among the disciplines

- Reading: something short TBA [possibly Peter Burke, "Images as Evidence in 17th-Century Europe," Journal of the History of Ideas 64 no. 2 (2003)]
- in-class exercises on what is history (also vs neighboring disciplines)
- Ian and Salmaan to present sources from their work

Monday January 30: plenary meeting (CGIS Tsai Auditorium/South Concourse, 6-8pm). Faculty to discuss the theme of their seminar and how they feel Farge's *Allure of the Archives* relates to it.

Week II (Wed 1 Feb): seminar—common reading

- Reading (course-wide): Kate Grandjean, "New World Tempests: Environment, Scarcity, and the Coming of the Pequot War," *The William and Mary Quarterly* 68:1 (January 2011), 75-100, and Wendy Anne Warren, "'The Cause of Her Grief': The Rape of a Slave in Early New England," *Journal of American History* 93:4 (March 2007), 1031-1049
- field trip to the Harvard University Archives?

Monday 6 Feb, 5pm: Paper #1 due (1500 words; ca. 5pp)
Interpretive essay centered on the common reading. Prompts TBA.

Week III (Wed 8 Feb): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.

Monday 13 Feb, 5pm: revised paper #1 due

Unit 2: historiography
Understanding successive layers of historical interpretation

Week IV (Wed 15 Feb): seminar: Herbert Butterfield

- Reading:
  - Herbert Butterfield, *The Whig Interpretation of History* (1931)
  - William Cronon, "Two Cheers for the Whig Interpretation of History," in *AHA Perspectives* Sept 2012
  - E.H. Carr *What is History?* (1961), pp. 50-54 on Butterfield
- Assignment: use E-resources to find one book review/response to Butterfield's book. Be prepared to present the main point of the book review to the class and to explain how you searched for and selected the book reviews.
- hands-on practice with Hollis and electronic resources.

Thursday Feb 16 (or thereabouts) 1-5pm: please come to office hours (as per sign-up distributed in seminar) to decide on a historical theme/area of interest to you, which will be the focus of paper #2 and ideally build toward your final paper. This is an appointment held jointly with Ann Blair and your tutor.

Week V (Wed Feb 22)--seminar: tropes in writing history

- Reading:
- Siep Stuurman, "Herodotus and Sima Qian: History and the Anthropological Turn in Ancient Greece and Han China," *Journal of World History* 19 (2008), 1-40 (pdf)
- excerpts from Herodotus (from Donald Kelley, *Versions of History*); Sima Qian, *Records of the Grand Historian, Han dynasty*, vol. 2, pp. 129-45 (pdf)

- Assignment: identify and read two secondary sources of your choice (ideally one book [OK to read in parts] and one article) on the theme you choose for paper #2. In-class exercise: each student to share the historiographic theme(s) of his or her topic.

Monday Feb 27, 5pm: Paper #2 due (1500 words, ca. 5 pp)
Prompt (seminar specific on historiography): write a historiographic essay comparing and contrasting at least two works of history on a topic of your choice. Skills to practice: constructing a historical argument in interaction with historiography

Week VI (Wed 1 March): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.
- Assignment to prepare for next seminar: choose a source to show at the next seminar (upload to dropbox the call # and cut and paste from full Hollis record)

Monday Mar 6, 5pm: revised paper #2 due

Unit 3: primary source analysis (coursewide)

Highlighting the range of historians' primary sources and of ways of analyzing them.

Week VII (March 8)—seminar held at Houghton Library
Meet in the lobby of Houghton Library. Please travel as light as possible—you will be asked to put all your belongings in a locker. Pencil and notepaper are provided in the classroom.

- viewing the primary sources selected by students from various collections
- sharing time with intellectual history seminar: discussing a common text?

Spring break (March 15)

Week VIII (Wed 22 March): seminar: reading a primary source

- Skill: close reading of a primary source
- Reading:
  - Edward Gibbon, *Rise and Fall of the Roman Empire* (1776) Edward Gibbon, Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire (1776) (pp #s refer to Womersley abridged ed; other editions are fine too--use the section titles for guidance): prefaces to the various editions + first 10 pages of chapter one (=pp. 3-19 in Womersley abridged ed; i.e. stop at beginning of the section entitled "legions under the emperors"); chapter 15 entire (pp 121-88); chapter 24, pp. 296-310 (from "personal behavior of Julian" through and including "death of Julian") + "General observations on the Fall of the Roman Empire in the West" pp. 434-43 (between chapters 38 and 39). [total : 107 pp]
  - skim table of contents of the entire Decline and Fall available here (see pp. 8-22 of the pdf on the website)
  - Peter Gay, Style in History, ch. on Gibbon (pp. 21-56)

- John Clive, Not by Fact Alone, on Gibbon's humor, pp. 55-65 Peter Gay, *Style in History*, ch. on Gibbon (pp. 21-56)
- John Clive, *Not by Fact Alone*, on Gibbon's humor, pp. 55-65
- final hour: students begin in-class preparation for capstone meeting presentation

Monday March 27, 5pm: statement of topic and annotated bibliography due

Week IX (Wed 28 March): tutorials

- Come to your tutorial session having printed, read, queried, and annotated the papers submitted by your fellow tutorial members. Session will include discussion of effective peer review techniques.

Monday April 3, 5pm: Paper #3 due (1500 words, ca. 5pp): Analysis of a passage from a primary source important to your final paper. No peer review for this paper which is designed to build toward the final paper.

Unit 4: synthesis

Merging historiographic and primary source analyses into a historical argument

Week X (April 5)--seminar: contextualizing a primary source, e.g. Gibbon

- Reading:
- Biographical context: J.G.A. Pocock, *Barbarism and Religion* (1999), vol. 1, ch 2 (on Lausanne context).
- Context of the history of history: Arnaldo Momigliano, "Gibbon's contribution to historical method" in *Studies in Historiography* (1966)
- Printing history: http://www.edwardgibbonstudies.com/Decline-Fall5.htm
- And skim Barker, Nicolas. "A Note on the Bibliography of Gibbon, 1776–1802," *The Library*, 5th ser., 18,1 (March 1963), 40-50.
- Context of reception: Pocock, *Barbarism and Religion*, vol. 5, one chapter TBD on reception
- students continue in-class preparation for capstone meeting presentation

Monday April 10, 5pm: outline of final paper due

Week XI (Wed April 12): seminar: in class presentations on final paper

- Skill: oral presentation with visuals
- Assignment: prepare a 5-minute oral with handouts, powerpoint, or prezi.
- Class devoted to 5-minute presentations followed by 5 minutes of discussion

Monday April 17, 5pm: Draft final papers due (ca. 3500 words); these should integrate historiographical analysis, primary source analysis, and contextualization

Week XII (Wed 19 April) : tutorials

- Reading: read the drafts of your peers as assigned

Week XIII (Wed 26 April) : last seminar --wrap-up

- no reading
- concluding discussion
- Students to finalize capstone meeting presentations

Monday May 1, 6-8pm: capstone event/shared reflections of whole course, CGIS Tsai Auditorium/South Concourse, 6-8pm. Students to present their skits/visual displays/etc to the entire course: 10 minutes per seminar, followed by social time.

Revised final papers due Wednesday, May 3, 5pm (last day of reading period) **OR** on the earliest of the "final deadline" dates for the Hist 97 seminars, which should be determined by the Registrar at the beginning of spring semester.